



DRAFT MINUTES

CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Wednesday, January 23, 2019

1. Committee Meeting Call to Order

Chair Larson called the meeting to order at 6:04 p.m.

CAC members present: Kian Alavi, Robert Gower, David Klein, John Larson, Jerry Levine and Peter Tannen (6)

CAC Members Absent: Myla Ablog, Becky Hogue and Rachel Zack (3)

Transportation Authority staff members present were Amber Crabbe, Anna LaForte, Maria Lombardo, Mike Pickford, Alberto Quintanilla, Steve Rehn, Mike Tan and Eric Young.

2. Chair's Report – INFORMATION

Chair Larson reported that the Transportation Authority would be hosting a community meeting for Lombard Crooked Street Reservation and Pricing Study on January 30, 2019 from 6-8 PM at Yick Wo Elementary School. He stated that the Transportation Authority was studying a reservation and pricing system to better manage traffic flow on the crooked section of Lombard Street. Chair Larson announced that BART service would be starting at 5 AM, one hour later than currently scheduled, for vital repairs and critical earthquake safety work, beginning February 11, 2019. He noted that Items 11 and 14 on the CAC meeting agenda were items requested by the CAC and invited Peter Tannen to share updates from the December 4, 2018 Transportation Authority Board meeting.

Peter Tannen reported that the Transportation Authority Board reappointed District 6 CAC representative, Beck Hogue and continued the appointment of a District 10 CAC representative to the February 12, 2019 Board meeting.

Chair Larson recognized former District 10 representative Chris Waddling on behalf of the CAC for his 6 years of service as Chairman and member of the CAC. He noted that Chris Waddling had encouraged him to apply to the CAC when the District 7 seat became open.

Maria Lombardo, Chief Deputy Director, thanked Chris Waddling for his service and ensuring that the voice of the community was always heard.

Anna LaForte, Deputy Director for Policy and Programming, thanked Chris Waddling for his 6 years of outstanding service as Chairman and member of the CAC and for being a strong advocate for sustainable transportation.

Chris Waddling thanked the CAC and Transportation Authority staff and noted that both groups have mutual goal of making San Francisco work better. He said he tried his best to advocate for District 10 and advised the CAC to do similarly on behalf of their communities. Mr. Waddling thanked Edward Mason and Roland Lebrun for their advocacy and inspiring him.

David Klein noted the recent decision by Ford Motor Company to close Chariot shuttle service

and said it spoke to the necessary sustainability of public transportation. He said the goal of public transportation was not to make a profit but instead create and support inclusive services that allow people to live their lives and get around. He thanked staff for their hard work.

Kian Alavi thanked Chris Waddling for his leadership and stewardship.

Jackie Sachs, former CAC member, thanked Chris Waddling for his camaraderie.

3. Election of Chair and Vice Chair for 2019 – ACTION

Alberto Quintanilla, Clerk of the Board, announced that at the November 28, 2018 CAC meeting the positions of CAC Chair and Vice Chair had been opened for nominations for the 2019 term. He said that for the Chair seat, John Larson was nominated to be elected.

Chair Larson stated that he would vow to run efficient and on-time meetings and that he had enjoyed his first year as Chair of the CAC.

During public comment Chris Waddling spoke in favor of Chair Larson and noted his ability to keep the CAC and the public on track and run efficient meetings.

The motion to elect John Larson as Chair was approved by the following vote.

Ayes: CAC Members Alavi, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine and Tannen (6)

Mr. Quintanilla said that for the Vice Chair seat, David Klein and Peter Tannen were nominated to be elected at the November 28, 2018 CAC meeting.

Peter Tannen said that he had previously served as Vice Chair and was willing to serve again but would prefer to see new members serve. He said he would be voting in favor of David Klein.

David Klein said he had prior experience serving on a Board and would look to Chair Larson for guidance.

During public comment Jackie Sachs said she supported Peter Tannen for Vice Chair.

The motion to elect David Klein as Vice Chair was approved by the following vote.

Ayes: CAC Members Alavi, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine and Tannen (6)

Consent Agenda

- 4. Approve the Minutes of the November 28, 2018 Meeting – ACTION**
- 5. Adopt a Motion of Support for the Approval of a Two-Year Professional Services Contract, with Options to Extend for Two Additional Two-Year Periods, to the University of Kentucky Research Foundation in an Amount Not to Exceed \$100,000 for Performance Monitoring and Analysis Services for the Congestion Management Program – ACTION**
- 6. Adopt a Motion of Support for the Approval of Three-Year Professional Services Contracts, with an Option to Extend for Two Additional One-Year Periods, to Civic Edge Consulting and Convey, Inc. in a Combined Amount Not to Exceed \$300,000 for On-Call Communications, Media and Community Relations – ACTION**
- 7. Adopt a Motion of Support to Authorize the Executive Director to Execute All Master Agreements, Program Supplemental Agreements, Fund Exchange Agreements, Fund Transfer Agreements, Cooperative Agreements, and Any Amendments Thereto with the California Department of Transportation for Receipt of Federal and State Funds, Including an Agreement for the Yerba Buena Island Westside Bridges Seismic Retrofit Project and the Yerba Buena Island Southgate Road Realignment Improvements Project – ACTION**

8. Internal Accounting and Investment Report for the Six Months Ending December 31, 2018 – INFORMATION

9. Citizens Advisory Committee Appointment – INFORMATION

10. Progress Report for Van Ness Avenue Bus Rapid Transit Project – INFORMATION

Peter Tannen requested that Item 10 be taken off the Consent Agenda.

Peter Gabancho, Project Manager at the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency (SFMTA) presented the item.

Peter Tannen said that this was the first project, during his 10-year tenure as a CAC member, that had him very concerned because of the project cost overruns and scheduling delays. Mr. Tannen provided a summary of an article in the San Francisco Chronicle and asked how the SFMTA planned to make up for lost time, once the underground work was completed.

Mr. Gabancho said SFMTA was working with the contractor to accelerate work but did not think SFMTA would be able to make up all the time that was lost. He said issues bringing a utility sub-contractor on board were a significant reason for the 279 days of delay claimed by Walsh Construction. He said significant portion of the time lost could be made up by resequencing and reordering some of the surface work and also by increasing the schedule of days worked per week. Mr. Gabancho noted that the utilities had been particularly challenging, due to unforeseen obstacles discovered when placing sewer lines.

Peter Tannen asked for a rough estimate of how much time could be made up, once the underground work was completed.

Mr. Gabancho said based on experience 100-200 days could be made up.

Robert Gower asked if the delays were a result of unforeseen obstacles or lack of foresight when planning the project.

Mr. Gabancho said the SFMTA worked for a year with Walsh Construction to work out the sequencing of the project before construction started. He said an example of unforeseen obstacles was a delay of overhead line poles due to design changes requested by the city and there only being two manufacturers in the country. He said resequencing the schedule of when overhead poles are installed would lead to a savings of the overall project schedule.

Peter Tannen asked if the project management team had been increased.

Mr. Gabancho said the project and construction management teams had both been increased, as well as SFMTA and their consultants bringing in additional staff.

Peter Tannen shared an overview of project percentage completion rates provided to the CAC from September 2017 to January 2019. He demonstrated the fluctuation of the completion rates from month to month and asked if completion percentages sent to the CAC were real.

Mr. Gabancho said the initial completion numbers accounted for all expenditures on construction but was later changed to reflect the expenditures towards the core project work. He listed a number of delays that the project had run into like not doing advance potholing and stalled work due to unknown gas lines being found. He said potholing was now being done far in advance to identify areas of concern.

Chair Larson asked if there had been lessons learned from the Van Ness Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) project that could be applied to the Geary BRT project and if Walsh Construction was part of the Geary BRT project.

Mr. Gabancho said Walsh Construction was not part of the Geary BRT project and noted that there was SFMTA staff overlap within the Van Ness BRT, Better Market Street and Geary BRT projects. He said SFMTA staff was applying lessons learned to all SFMTA projects.

Chair Larson asked that the item be moved to the regular agenda for the next few CAC meetings.

During public comment Edward Mason asked why overhead line poles were being installed when the Muni had a 2035 goal of making all buses battery operated.

Jackie Sachs said the right turn on red at stop lights and placing bus platforms in the middle of the street made it difficult for disabled individuals to cross the street safely. She asked how SFMTA had taken into consideration the need to provide time for seniors and disabled persons to cross the street.

Kian Alavi moved to approve the Consent Agenda, seconded by Jerry Levine.

The Consent Agenda was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Alavi, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine and Tannen (6)

Absent: CAC Members Ablog, Hogue and Zack (3)

End of Consent Agenda

11. Presentation on the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency's Review of Muni Training Procedures, Policies, Hiring Practices, and Retention of Current Operators – INFORMATION

Donald Ellison, SFMTA Director of Human Resources and Payroll, presented the item.

Kian Alavi asked what the average salary was for Muni operators.

Mr. Ellison said the annual salary for Muni operators was between \$63,000 - \$112,000.

Kian Alavi noted that the salary was currently considered low-income in the city of San Francisco. He asked if there was a finder's fee for bus operators to recruit new operators and if the exam pipeline could be reduced to under 30 days.

Mr. Ellison said there was no finder's fee for operators and said since any civil service exam may be challenged by the applicant, it was difficult to reduce the exam pipeline to under 30 days.

Kian Alavi suggested recruiting Transportation Network Company (TNC) drivers to fill Muni operator vacancies.

Jerry Levine commented that according to anecdotal reports, Muni's bus service for the bus bridge during the Twin Peaks Tunnel shutdown was better than the M-Line light rail service. He asked if other public transportation agencies were sharing operator applicants with Muni.

Mr. Ellison said the Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority was advising applicants to apply to Muni because it had closed its employment opportunity due to funding problems.

Jerry Levine asked if other transit agencies in the region were having similar operator shortages.

Mr. Ellison said recruitment difficulties were an issue across the board among both public and private sector transportation operations.

Jerry Levine asked how extensive Muni's recruitment was regionally.

Mr. Ellison said Muni's recruitment cast a wide net, with outreach throughout the nine Bay Area counties and occasional responses from outside the Bay Area.

Peter Tannen mentioned that the enclosure provided an executive summary of six recommendations made by the Budget and Legislative Analyst. He asked if the SFMTA was following up on the recommendations and how the reported operator absentee rate of 26% compared with other transit agencies.

Mr. Ellison said SFMTA's absentee rate was low compared to other public transit agencies. He said SFMTA was implementing the Budget and Legislative Analyst Office's recommendations and results would be reported to the Board of Supervisors at a future date.

During public comment Edward Mason asked for a definition of what constituted an absence and if it included people who were on disability. He asked if Director Reiskin held weekly staff meetings to avoid the "perfect storm" that Mr. Ellison had described. He suggested that absenteeism related to long commutes might be mitigated if the rebuild projects at the Potrero and Presidio maintenance facilities included employee housing.

Jackie Sachs said the published and posted Muni schedules were unrealistic and incorrect, and should be revised to provide more accurate ride time estimates. She also suggested that at transfer stops drivers should communicate with one another to ensure that passengers are able to catch connecting buses.

Mr. Ellison said he would follow up with the CAC in writing to answer questions raised during public comment.

12. Adopt a Motion of Support for the Allocation of \$3,526,007 in Prop K Sales Tax Funds, with Conditions, for Two Requests – ACTION

Anna LaForte, Deputy Director for Policy and Programming, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Chair Larson noted that last year's Bike to Work Day request stated that performance measures for the event would include a comparison of participation rates from prior years and would be shared with the public.

Ms. LaForte said staff would add a comparison of participation rates to the recommended deliverables.

During public comment Edward Mason said that developers were only providing 40% of the funding for expansion of the Muni Metro East light rail facility, and the public would therefore be responsible for most of the project funding. He said growth should bear the costs of growth. He also opposed funding for Bike to Work Day 2019 because mode share data was already being collected through several other venues and suggest that the event be conducted every other year.

Jackie Sachs also expressed her opposition to funding for Bike to Work Day 2019.

Peter Tannen moved to approve the item, seconded by Robert Gower

The item was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Alavi, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine and Tannen (6)

Absent: CAC Members Ablog, Hogue and Zack (3)

13. Adopt a Motion of Support for the Allocation of \$11,115,000 and Appropriate \$500,000 in Prop K Sales Tax Funds, with Conditions, for Six Requests – ACTION

Anna LaForte, Deputy Director for Policy and Programming presented the item staff memorandum.

Jerry Levine asked why the Breda light rail vehicles (LRVs) overhaul was not funded through the

SFMTA operating budget. He noted that the four areas of need for the overhaul were listed as common issues.

Ms. LaForte said that from a funding agency perspective the Breda LRVs overhaul was a major capital maintenance project as opposed to an ongoing maintenance activity, and that the scope was eligible for Federal Transit Administration funding.

Alex Hollowell, Transit Capital Planning Manager at SFMTA, said Muni performed ongoing light maintenance on their Breda LRVs, but upgrade of these four key systems was needed to ensure that the vehicles could achieve their useful life. Ms. Hollowell noted that these systems are the common cause of problems that result in vehicles being taken out of service. She highlighted the need to replace the heating, ventilation and air conditioning systems because the refrigerant used in the existing HVAC systems no longer complied with environmental standards.

Peter Tannen asked if renderings of the Port's pedestrian walkway project or images of similar projects could be shared with the CAC.

Dan Hodapp, Senior Waterfront Manager at the Port of San Francisco provided images of the existing site and said the project would provide a safe and comfortable walkway for ferry passengers between The Embarcadero Promenade and Ferry Pier Plaza and would separate vehicles from pedestrians.

During public comment Edward Mason asked whether the Breda LRV overhauls would be performed by the manufacturer or if Muni staff would be doing the work. He also asked if a mid-life overhaul had been performed on the vehicles.

Cody Hicks, Transportation Planner at the SFMTA, said the Breda LRVs had gone through mini overhauls in the past, and said the bulk of the work would be performed by Muni maintenance staff.

David Klein moved to approve the item, seconded by Kian Alavi

The item was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Alavi, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine and Tannen (6)

Absent: CAC Members Ablog, Hogue and Zack (3)

14. Adopt a Motion of Support for Approval of the Valencia Street Bikeway Implementation Plan Final Report [NTIP Planning] – ACTION

Kimberly Leung, Program Manager at the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, presented the item.

The CAC lost quorum at 8:06 p.m. during Item 14. The meeting was adjourned. Chair Larson continued the meeting as a workshop with any presentations or public comment not on the record.

The CAC regained quorum at 8:08 p.m. during Item 14. Chair Larson called the meeting to order.

Robert Gower asked what solutions are being considered for the school loading zone areas as the protected bike lanes will now be in between school drop-off area and their schools.

Kimberly Leung said SFMTA is installing concrete loading islands with railings, as well as designated crossing for pedestrians. As part of the pilot project, SFMTA will evaluate the effectiveness of this and other safety measures and adjust the design accordingly. She said they currently have parking control officers in the morning and afternoon to assist students crossing

the bikeway and identify issues.

Robert Gower asked for the location of the loading islands.

Kimberly Leung said one loading island was located in front of San Francisco Friends School, on Valencia Street between Duboce and 14th streets, and another loading island was on the opposite side of the street outside of Millennium School.

Peter Tannen commented that he was surprised to see 2-way parking protected bike lanes as a potential design alternative. He also said that in general, old bike lanes were straight paths as opposed to the new designs that required weaving. He asked if the change in design of the bike lanes would cause additional problems.

Kimberly Leung commented that the parking protected bike lane design for the pilot project had weaving and said an example was for a parklet on Valencia Street. She said the long-term project was looking at how to avoid obstacles that were adjacent to sidewalks. She also said one way to address the issue around weaving was to install signal priority for bike lanes but such changes would be considered for the long-term project.

David Klein asked what the solutions were to keep TNCs out of the bike lane on Valencia Street.

Kimberly Leung said there were members of the project team that were solely focused on the curb management aspect and also mentioned that the SFMTA has a team working on developing a curb management policy that will guide how they deal with different TNCs. She added that the pilot project was examining time of day use for loading zones which could turn into passenger loading zones at certain times of day.

Kian Alavi thanked the project team for their work and said he looked forward to having protected bike lanes installed throughout the corridor.

Chair Larson said that he always thought it was odd that vehicles could park freely on weekends and after 6 PM on the corridor. He said he was in favor of the curb management work and examining time of day use for loading zones.

During public comment Edward Mason asked if the project was a result of TNCs creating the need for protected bike lanes and loading zones. He also asked why the City Attorney Office was not filing a lawsuit against TNCs.

Kian Alavi said that cars double parking and blocking bike lanes on Valencia Street had been issues prior to the arrival of TNCs.

Kian Alavi moved to approve the item, seconded by David Klein.

The item was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Alavi, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine and Tannen (6)

Absent: CAC Members Ablog, Hogue and Zack (3)

15. Adopt a Motion of Support for Approval of the 2019 Transportation Fund for Clean Air Program Local Expenditure Criteria – ACTION

Mike Pickford, Senior Transportation Planner, presented the item staff memorandum.

There was no public comment.

Kian Alavi moved to approve the item, seconded by Robert Gower.

The item was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Alavi, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine and Tannen (6)

Absent: CAC Members Ablog, Hogue and Zack (3)

16. Adopt a Motion of Support for Approval of the 2019 State and Federal Legislative Program – ACTION

Amber Crabbe, Public Policy Manager, presented the item per the staff memorandum.

Chair Larson asked who was in charge of collecting the sales tax from out of state retailers.

Ms. Crabbe said the new California Department of Tax and Fee Administration would start collecting the sales tax starting April 1, 2019. She said the state legislature and governor would want to weigh in and that currently there was a mix of laws regarding state or local tax collection and whether the tax was collected at point of distribution or point of delivery. She added that Transportation Authority staff would continue to monitor the situation.

Maria Lombardo said there were mixed views on the CASA compact regarding housing that would be discussed at future CAC and Board meetings.

During public Edward Mason said that he believed that the CASA compact would undermine the roles of local planning departments if adopted by the state legislator.

Jerry Levine moved to approve the item, seconded by Robert Gower

The item was approved by the following vote:

Ayes: CAC Members Alavi, Gower, Klein, Larson, Levine and Tannen (6)

Absent: CAC Members Ablog, Hogue and Zack (3)

17. Introduction of New Business – INFORMATION

There were no new items introduced.

The CAC lost quorum at 8:25 p.m. during Item 17. The meeting was adjourned. Chair Larson continued the meeting as a workshop with any presentations or public comment not on the record.

18. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

19. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 8:25 p.m.